

YESHIVA PIRCHEI SHOSHANIM SHULCHAN ARUCH PROJECT

Hilchos Melicha Shiur 1

Mareh Makomos for this shiur

Siman 69:1

Pri Megadim Psicha -

vata avo Ifaresh

Mechaber, Rama, Taz, Shach

Chavas Da'as Biurim 1

Written by Harav Don Channen
Contributing Editor R' Aharon Schenkolewski

Edition 9.2

© Yeshiva Pirchei Shoshanim

This shiur may not be reproduced in any form without permission of the copyright holder

164 Village Path, Lakewood NJ 08701 732.370.3344
Rechov Kahanaman 54, Bnei Brak, 03.616.6340

Hadacha Rishona

Siman 69 The Laws Of Salting And Rinsing, including 21 Seifim (Amendments)

1 (1) 1) Meat needs to be washed before salting it **(2) 2)** (*if the butcher washed the meat then there is no need to wash it at home*). If after [the meat] was washed **3)** it was cut into two or three pieces **4)** (*or if (3) the hooves were removed after it was washed*) another washing is needed.

RAMA *If this was not done [the meat] is considered not washed.*

*L'chatchila*¹ *one must take additional care to wash meat by soaking it for one half hour and washing it off well in the water in which it is being soaked. However, if one did not soak [the meat], 5) but did wash [the meat] well this is considered enough. After [washing] (4) 6) wait a little for the water to [finish] dripping [from the meat] before salting, in order that the water [on the surface] should not dissolve the salt and not remove the blood.*

(5) 7) *The custom is to not to place other things (food) in the vessel that was used for soaking the meat. (6) If the meat was left soaking continuously for 24 hours 8) then the meat and the vessel are assur. 9) We will discuss this point later in this chapter. However [if the meat was soaked for] less than 24 hours there is no need to be strict [and forbid the meat and utensil]. Furthermore, even in a situation where the vessel became assur, 10) it is still permitted to use it for soaking [other meat].*

11) *The laws of meat frozen in ice and its proper method of soaking are discussed in siman 68.*

¹ A situation in which the validity of an action is being considered before the action occurs.

Chullin 113 A Shmuel said, “Blood is not removed from meat unless it is salted יפה יפה (very well) and washed יפה יפה.

Rav Huna said, “Salt and wash”.

In the *Braisa* it says, “Wash, salt, and wash.”

(The *gemora* continues) There is no contradiction: In one case the butchers had washed the meat (the case of *Rav Huna*) and in the other case the butchers did not wash the meat (the case of the *Braisa*).

The Effect of Salt

Before we learn the reasons for הדחה ראשונה (the first rinsing) we must ask ourselves, “What effect does salt have on meat?”

The **Chavas Da’as**² says that salt has two effects on meat: 1) the “nature” of salt and 2) the “heat” salt causes.

The Nature of Salt

Regarding the nature of salt the *Chavas Da’as*³ brings a *machlokes* between the *Rosh* and *Other Poskim*. According to the **Rosh** (as well as the *Ran* and *Mordechai* who hold that salting without *hadacha rishona* will not cause the *dom b'ain* to enter the meat, as we will soon see) salt only takes blood out (much like a magnet) from meat. The **Other Poskim** (*Smak*, *Smag*, *Sha'ari Dura*, *Maharai* and *Issur V'heter* who hold that *hadacha rishona* is because the surface blood will enter the meat) hold that salt will also drive the surface blood into meat as well as draw blood out of the meat (it can do both actions), however they can not be done simultaneously. Therefore, if the meat is not washed off before *melicha* the blood on the surface will go into the meat because the salt drives in the blood before it has a chance to draw out blood. Blood that was driven in by the nature of salt cannot be taken out by resalting.

The Heat of Salt

The other factor that we must consider is that salt causes a heat effect (there is an argument if this happens immediately or after time, we will learn more about this in

² On the next page (line 11; *Machon* edition, line 23)

³ Found in the back of the *Shulchan Aruch*, *Biurim* 1, line 9; in the *Machon* edition page 2, line 7

siman 105). The *Rosh* will agree that the heat effect of salt can cause blood to get absorbed into the meat. However, by *dam plaita* (blood that comes out through salting) we can apply the rules of לא בלע and אידי דטרוד לפלוט לא בלע⁴ and אידי דיפלוט דם דידיה יפלוט מה שבלע⁴. Another difference between the nature of salt and the heat of salt is that blood which is absorbed thru the nature of salt, will get absorbed in the entire piece but blood which gets absorbed through the heat of salt, *m'ikar hadin* (the most basic law accepted) will only get absorbed a כדי קליפה⁵.

The main point we will focus on in this *shiur* is whether the salt reacts with the blood in the meat if there is no הדחה ראשונה. And, if so, what takes place.

Hadacha Rishona

In *Hilchos Melicha* the first thing which we learn is that meat needs to be washed before it is salted.

In his introduction to *Hilchos Melicha* the **Pri Megadim** [Starting ועתה⁶] brings down 6 reasons found in the *Rishonim* as to why we need to do הדחה ראשונה.

One of the major arguments between the *Rishonim* is whether or not the salt had any affect on the blood in the meat if no הדחה ראשונה was done.

1. The Ra'ah

It is good advice to remove the surface blood so that it will not be absorbed later. The problem arises when the meat finishes giving off its own blood and *tzir* - the watery liquid found in meat. At this point the meat will absorb the blood on the surface since there is no outgoing flow to prevent the surface blood from being pushed in by the salt still on the meat. There is an argument when this occurs. This depends on how long it takes for all the *tzir* to come out. Some say that *tzir* comes out for 12 hours others say that *tzir* come out for 24 hours.⁷

⁴ See Introduction to Melicha.

⁵ The thinnest surface that can be removed in one piece (Shach 96:21)

⁶ Old edition in the second column; just the first few lines and then 18 lines down from the top of the paragraph until 7 lines from the bottom of the paragraph. *Machon* edition page 62

⁷ However, if it was washed and salted even if the salt is left on for 24 hours the meat is *muter* since the *Ra'ah* holds that there is 60 in the meat against the *dam plaita* but not against the *dom plaita* together with the surface blood.

2. The Ran

Because the meat has dried on the surface and it formed a type of crust which prevents the salt from reacting with the blood. Note: This is according to the **Pri Megadim**. However, according to the **Shach**, the *Ran's* opinion is the same as the *Yaish Omrim* in the *Mordechai*.

3. The Mordechai

Because of the bloody surface grime. If the salt fills up with the blood on the surface it will not have the strength to pull out the blood from within the meat.

4. The Yaish Omrim in the Mordechai

To soften the meat in order that the blood should easily flow out during the salting. Therefore it needs to be soaked at least a half-hour. If the meat is not softened no blood will come out.

5. The Smak

The blood found on the surface of the meat has the *din* of דם בעין.⁸ דם בעין is driven into the meat by the salt even if blood is coming out of the meat. (This is according to the *Pri Megadim*, however according to the *Chavas Da'as* surface blood is not true *dom bain* and therefore will only get absorbed before the blood starts coming out).

6. The Rosh

If the meat is not rinsed some blood will come out and go back in. The *Pri Megadim* explains that the *Rosh* holds that *badacha rishona* is to soften the meat so that the blood will flow easily out of the meat. If the meat is not softened then the blood flows out slowly. If the blood is flowing too slowly out of the meat not all of the blood will come out and the blood that did come out will start to be reabsorbed into the meat.

⁸ See introduction to Hilchos Melicha page III.

The Differences between the Opinions

In the same paragraph the **Pri Megadim** highlights the *halachic* differences that can result from holding each position of the *Rishonim* mentioned above. Each has a *chumra* (stringency) and a *kula* (leniency).

1. The Ra'ah

The *chumra* is that the blood on the surface of the meat will be absorbed into the meat after the 12 or 24 hour time period. This blood cannot be removed by a second salting because the meat has no blood of its own to carry out the blood that was driven in. In short, there is no way to get this blood out so if the salt was left on for 12 or 24 hours the meat becomes forbidden.

Furthermore, if this meat is cooked it is *assur* even in a *hefsed m'rubeh*, as opposed to meat that was cooked without salting which is *mutar* in a *hefsed m'rubeh* if there is 60 against it, as we will learn in *seif*¹¹.

The *kula* is that if the meat was salted without *הדחה ראשונה* and you cooked the meat after the 12 or 24 hour time period then the food in the pot⁹ would be permitted if there was enough food in the pot, counting the meat, to *mevatel* (negate, render insignificant) the blood found on the surface (60 times the blood on the surface).¹⁰ This is because the salt worked to pull the blood out of the meat. The only *issur* (prohibited item) left is the blood on the unwashed surface that went into the meat.¹¹ The *Pri Megadim* says however that according to us (*Asbeknazim* that follow the *Rama*) since we say *ch'n'n*¹² 60 is needed against the whole piece of meat.¹³

⁹ The meat itself remains *assur* because of the rule "*efshar l'shochato assur*". See our Introduction to Issur V'heter.

¹⁰ We will discuss more about how to *mevatel issur* in later shiurim. Simply speaking one needs 60 times the volume of *beter* (something permitted) against the volume of *issur* in order to *mevatel* the *issur*. The concept of *mevatel* means to render negligible the *issur*. When the *beter* is 60 times the *issur* we can be sure that the *issur* is not apparent in taste or name. Therefore it *halachically* does not exist.

¹¹ However according to the other *Rishonim* you would need 60 times the whole piece.

¹² See our introduction *shiur* to *Issur V'heter*.

¹³ Another *kula* is that if the meat was salted without *הדחה ראשונה* or *הדחה אחרונה* (the final rinsing) and you cooked the meat before the 12 or 24 hour time period then the meat would be permitted if there was enough food in the pot, counting the meat, to *mevatel* (negate, render insignificant) the blood found on the surface (60 times the blood on the surface).

2. The Ran

The *chumra* is that the meat has a crusty surface that must be softened, therefore to take out blood it needs more than a simple washing. Yet, the piece of meat does not need to be soaked to soften the middle. Rather one should wash and vigorously rub the meat, well enough to soften the crust (**Sifsai Da'as** 1). This allows the salt to have an affect on the blood. The *kula* is that if the meat was cut before it was salted it does not have to be washed again.

3. The Mordechai

The *chumra* is that if we cut the meat in two before we salt it we will now create new surface blood on the area that was cut and it needs הדחה ראשונה on the new surface. The *kula* is that we do not need to go to the extreme of soaking the meat.

4. The Yaish Omrim in the Mordechai

The *chumra* is that if the meat is not soaked it is hard and the blood will not come out at all. Therefore a simple rinsing is not sufficient; one must soak the meat for a half an hour. The *kula* is if one cuts the meat in two after it was soaked, a second rinsing before salting is not needed even for the newly exposed area. We are not worried about surface blood at all.

5. The Smak

Surface blood has the *din* of דם בעין. If the meat is not washed off the דם בעין will be driven into the meat. דם בעין cannot be removed and the whole piece of meat becomes forbidden.

6. The Rosh

The *chumra* is that we need to soften the surface area of the meat in order that the blood can easily flow out (see the last few lines of the *Ma'adanei Yom Tov* [alef] on page 390 in *Chullin*). If this was not done blood will flow out and then back into the meat. However the meat can be washed again properly and resalted because the blood that was reabsorbed will “piggyback” out on the blood still in the meat. The *kula* is that if the meat was cut after *badacha rishona* it does not need another *badacha*.

L'halacha

We see that the **Mechaber** holds like the **Mordechai** since he writes that rinsing is enough and that if the meat is cut in two or three pieces the new surface area needs to be washed again.

The **Rama** holds that the main reason is like the **Mordechai**. However, if there is not a *hefsed m'rubeh* (a great loss) then we must also be concerned about the opinion of the **Smak** (since this is also the opinion of the *Smag*, *Sha'ari Dura*, and *Haga'os Sha'ari Dura*) and therefore a second washing would not permit the meat (as we will learn in *seif 2*). Furthermore, *l'chatchila* one should follow all the opinions. Therefore, one should follow the *Yaish Ommim* of the *Mordechai* and soak the meat for a half hour.

Halacha L'ma'aseh

Ashkenazim follow the *Rama*.

Sefardim: It has become the general custom of most, if not all, Sephardim to follow the stricter opinion of the *Rama l'chatchila*. But in a case of *sha'as hadechak* (a case of emergency), *erev Shabbos*, or for guests it is enough to just rinse the meat well. See *Yalkut Yosef* Vol. 8, page 258, *Kaf HaChaim* 69:17 and 69:19.

The Butcher's Rinsing

THE RAMA QUOTES THE TUR:

If the butcher washed the meat then there is no need to wash it again at home.

The *Achronim*¹⁴ ask what is the *chidush* (new fact being taught) of this *din*?

There are few answers given:

1. The **Taz** (2) answers that it would seem that we could learn that the type of rinsing that the butchers did is enough even though they did not soak it. However, this does not suffice according to the *Rama* who requires soaking, therefore he answers that the *chidush* is that we do not have to wash the meat a second time if it was done by the butchers. The *Mishb'tzos Zahav* learns that the *Taz* means the same as the *Prisha*. The **Prisha** says that we learn that we don't need to salt the meat immediately after washing it.
2. The **Bach** (1) says that we do not suspect that the butchers did not do a good rinsing.
3. The **Bach** gives another answer that we are not afraid that the meat got dirty again from the blood in the butcher house.

¹⁴ Rabbinic authorities that lived in from the 16th century and onwards

4. The **Chavas Da'as** (2) says that the *chidush* is that if the rinsing is done in the slaughtering house when the blood is still warm then a simple washing is enough, scrubbing and soaking is not necessary.

The **Shach** (2) says that if we know that the butcher washed the meat then we can assume that it was washed properly. The **Pischai Tshuva** (2) says that this is only where the *minbag* of the butchers is to soak the meat.¹⁵

Hooves

The **Rama** says that if the foot was washed and then the hooves were removed another washing is needed. The **Shach** (4) adds that if the hooves were not removed then *hadacha rishona* is sufficient the way it is. He points out that there is still a problem because the meat in the hooves is considered as being salted in a *keli she'aino menukav* - a utensil without holes (salting must be done in utensil that has holes in order for the blood to drain). He says (as explained by the **Chavas Da'as**) that if we would say that the washing on the hooves is not sufficient then 60 would be needed in the area above the hooves against the surface blood of the meat in the hooves. However, since washing the hooves is sufficient all that is *assur* is the meat in the hooves and 60 is not needed in the rest of the foot.

Types of Hadacha

THE RAMA SAYS

However, if one did not soak [the meat], 5) but did wash [the meat] well this is considered enough.

There are three levels of *hadacha* that are discussed.

1. הדחה מועטת – Washing enough to remove the surface blood. From the **Gilyon Maharsha** (5) we see this includes a שיפשוף (scrubbing or rubbing).
2. הדחה היטב – Rinsing including a good scrubbing and then rinsing again until the water is clear (**Gilyon Maharsha** 15 in the name of **Rabbainu Yona**).
3. שרייה – soaking.

¹⁵ However, we will see shortly that the **Shach** himself holds that even if *shriah* was not done it is enough.

M'ikar badin we are worried about the blood on the surface of the meat. The *Mechaber* holds that *l'chatchila* one must wash the surface fairly well. The *Rama* holds that *l'chatchila* we have to soak the meat because we are worried about all opinions. *B'diavad* (after the fact) the *halacha* follows:

- 1) If one did a superficial rinsing the **Shach** (5) holds that it is good *b'diavad* only if it is now salted. If you didn't salt it yet, then do a *שרייה* (soaking). According to **Rabbi Akiva Eiger** (*Seif* 2) it is only enough if it was already cooked.
- 2) If one did a *הדחה היטב* the **Shach** holds that *b'diavad* it is good enough even if the meat is not yet salted. You do not have to take the trouble to soak the meat. According to **Rabbi Akiva Eiger** it is only good enough if it was salted.
- 3) The *Rama* says that *l'chatchila* one should soak the meat. The **Chachmas Adam** (*Klal 30 din 3*) says that in the case of a great need where one does not have time to soak the meat for a half hour (for example *erev Shabbos*) he should wash and scrub the meat well and then wash the meat off again until the water comes out clear.

Frozen Meat

THE RAMA SAYS

11) *The laws of meat frozen in ice and its proper method of soaking are discussed in siman 68.*

The **Shach** (11) says that frozen meat can not be salted until it defrosts. If the meat is salted and freezes before *שיעור מליחה* (the time that the meat must be left in the salt – we will learn that this is a minimum of 18 minutes) it should be salted again. If it was not salted again but only left in the original salt for a *שיעור מליחה* after it defrosted it is *mutar b'diavad*.

The **Baer Haitaiv** (8), **R' Akiva Eiger** (on the *Pri Megadim*) and **Machtzis Hashekel** bring the **Pri Chadash** that holds that we can combine the time that the meat was salted before it froze with the time it was salted after it defrosted. This is also the opinion of the **Soless L'mincha**¹⁶ (*kelal 15 din 3 s"e 4*). However, the **Sifsai Da'as** (11) and **Chavas Da'as** (*chidushim* 10) say that we see from the *Shach* that we can not

¹⁶ Written by the *Minchas Ya'akov* and found in the old editions of the *Toras Chatas*.

combine the time it was salted before it froze with the time it was salted after it defrosted.

Review Questions

1. What are the effects of salt and what are the practical differences?
2. What are the six reasons for *hadacha rishona*?
3. If the meat was cut after the washing does it have to be washed again?
What are the opinions of the *Rishonim* and what is the *halacha*?
4. According to which opinion must the meat be soaked for a half hour?
5. According to which opinion does the *Mechaber* and *Rama* hold?
6. What is the *chidush* that the butcher's washing is enough?
7. What type of washing is enough *b'diavad* even if the meat was not salted according to the *Shach*?
8. Is a consecutive 18 minutes required to salt meat or can it be done in two separate times?

Questions on Shiurim

Question

According to the *Rosh* the blood will come out and go back in if a *hadacha rishona* is not done to the meat, how does this coincide with the opinion of the *Chavas Das* who says that according to the *Rosh* the nature of salt is only to be *maflit* and not *manlia*?

Answer

The blood coming out of the meat is due to the nature of salt, however the blood going back into the meat is due to the *raticha* of salt. We cannot say “*k'bolo kach polto*” because the flow of blood out is too slow, i.e. the hot blood is being driven in faster than the original blood is being expelled.

Question

Why does the *Pri Megadim* write in the paragraph beginning “*Uli'inyan Hilchasa*” that it's also possible that the *Mechaber* holds like the *Ram*? It would seem that according to the

Ran you would **not** have to rinse the meat again if it was cut into two or three pieces, since the point of rinsing is to soften the outer surface of the meat and we are not concerned with the surface blood. This is in opposition to the ruling of the *Mechaber* who holds that you **must** rinse the meat again if it was cut?!

Answer

Thank you for pointing this out. We have to say that the *Pri Megadim* means that the *Mechaber* holds like the *Mordechai* and its possible that he also holds like the *Ran*, therefore the *Mechaber* would require *shifshuf* (rubbing).

Question

In a case where the meat is soaked for 1/2 an hour, satisfying the *Yaish Ommim* in the *Mordechai*, would the *Smak* require another *hadacha* for *dom b'ain* even though it is soaked? What does the *Smak* hold in the case of cutting?

Answer

It is because of *dom b'ain* that the *Rama* writes that "the meat should be washed well in the water that it is being soaked". If the meat is cut *dom b'ain* comes out and therefore according to the *Smak* the piece must be washed again.

Question

In **Shach** (3) on the top of page 66 he brings the **Ran** who talks about butchers needing 3 knives. What's this about?

Answer

The *Ran* holds that a butcher needs 3 knives. 1 to *shecht* (slaughter) the animal, 1 to cut the meat and one to cut the *chailev* (forbidden fats). Since the *Ran* holds that after the meat is cut it does not need to be washed therefore you can not use the same knife for both non-kosher and kosher.

Question

I don't understand the end of **Shach** (10) about leaving meat for 24hrs. He says it's ok because it gives off a bad taste?

Answer

We have a rule that the absorbed tastes in a utensil do not give a good taste after 24 hours (this is known as *aino ben yoma*). Therefore, *b'dianad* it will not *osser* the food. However, *l'chatchila* the *keli* should not be used. This is because *Chazal* (*Chachamainu Zichrono L'vracha* -- our Rabbis of blessed memory) made a *gezaira* not to use an *aino ben yoma keli* so that one should not use a *ben yoma keli*.

Question

Regarding the *machlokes* about *shiur melicha* that is not consecutive, is that only if it is frozen in between or even when salting it at two different times during the day?

Answer

Your question would have ramifications if the meat was washed before the end of *shiur melicha*. The question would be does the meat have to be salted another complete *shiur melicha* or can we include the first salting. The answer is that it is the same *machlokes*. This is because the reasons brought by the *Achronim* by meat that froze also apply to this case. The *Pri Chadash* says that freezing does not *mevatel* (nullify) the blood that already came out. Therefore, certainly in our case the blood that came out is not *batel*. According to those that say that we can not combine the salting when it is frozen in middle this is because the heat of salt is negated and so we have to start from scratch. Therefore, in our case as well we have to start from scratch.